Data Integration in the Life Sciences

Sarah Cohen-Boulakia

Université Paris Sud, LRI CNRS UMR 8623

<u>cohen@lri.fr</u> 01 69 15 32 16 <u>https://www.lri.fr/~cohen/teaching.html</u> Very large Data and Knowledge in Bioinformatics



Introduction

- Understanding Life Sciences
- > Progress in multiple domains: biology, chemistry, maths, computer science...
- Emergence of new technologies: Next generation sequencing,...
 - \rightarrow Increasing volumes of raw data
 - \rightarrow All stored in Web data sources
- Raw data are not sufficient
 - → Data Annotated by experts
 - → Bioinformatics analysis of data
 - ➔ New data sources

PARIS

université

- Concrete example: Querying NCBI Entrez
 - http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/gquery/

(« Gquery NCBI » on google ^(C))

Querying (NCBI Portal)

SNCBI Resources 🖸 How To 🖂

nprendre le mond

Search NGBI G		ong QT syndrome			Search
Results found in	29 databas	ses for "Long QT syndrome"	0		latahases querie
Literature			Genes	.90	latabases queries
Books	353	books and reports	EST	2	expressed sequence tag sequences
MeSH	19	ontology used for PubMed indexing	Gene	33	collected information about gene loci
NLM Catalog	28	books, journals and more in the NLM Collections	GEO DataSets	1	functional genomics studies
PubMed	7,632	scientific & medical abstracts/citations	GEO Profiles	0	gene expression and molecular abundance profiles
PubMed Central	8,065	full-text journal articles	HomoloGene	11	homologous gene sets for selected organisms
Health			PopSet	0	sequence sets from phylogenetic and population studies
ClinVar	1,089	human variations of clinical significance	UniGene	5	clusters of expressed transcripts
dbGaP	138	genotype/phenotype interaction studies	Proteins		
GTR	228	genetic testing registry			
MedGen	54	medical genetics literature and links	Conserved Domains	0	conserved protein domains
	59	online mendelian inheritance in man	Protein	232	protein sequences
PubMed Health	119	clinical effectiveness, disease and drug reports	Protein Clusters	0	sequence similarity-based protein clusters
Genomes			Structure	11	experimentally-determined biomolecular structures
Assembly	0	genome assembly in			
BioProject	7	biological projects pi	s know	na	about the roteins and
		Long	QT sy	/nc	drome?

OMIM entry (Long QT)

§ OM	IM Entry - # 611818	- ×				
>	C 🗋 omim.	org/entry/61	1818			२ 📩 🔶 🗄
ne About	Statistics - Downloads - Help	 External Links Terms 	of Use + Contact Us N	IIMmatch □ <i>NEW</i>		Sélectionner une langue 🔻
Long QT synd Advanced Sea	Irome arch + Display Options +	Search	1			
# 611818						Table of Contents for #611818 Title
LONG QT SYNDROME 9; LQT9						Phenotype-Gene Relationships Text Description
Alternative titles: symbols LONG QT SYNDROME 9, ACQUIRED, SUSCEPTIBILITY TO, INCLUDED LONG QT SYNDROME 2/9, DIGENIC, INCLUDED; LQT2/9, DIGENIC, INCLUDED					Molecular Genetics Phenotypic Series Deferences	
Alternative t LONG QT S LONG QT S	SYNDROME 9, ACQUIRED, 51 SYNDROME 2/9, DIGENIC, IN	CLUDED; LQT2/9, DIGE	NIC, INCLUDED			Creation Date
Alternative t LONG QT S LONG QT S Phenotype-	SYNDROME 9, ACQUIRED, SU SYNDROME 2/9, DIGENIC, IN Gene Relationships	CLUDED; LQT2/9, DIGE	NIC, INCLUDED			Creation Date Edit History External Links for Entry:
Alternative t LONG QT S LONG QT S Phenotype- Location	SYNDROME 9, ACQUIRED, SU SYNDROME 2/9, DIGENIC, IN Gene Relationships Phenotype	CLUDED; LQT2/9, DIGE	NIC, INCLUDED	Gene/Locus	Gene/Locus	Creation Date Edit History External Links for Entry: > Protein
Alternative t ONG QT S ONG QT S Nenotype- location	SYNDROME 9, ACQUIRED, 51 SYNDROME 2/9, DIGENIC, IN Gene Relationships Phenotype	CLUDED; LQT2/9, DIGE Phenotype MIM number	NIC, INCLUDED Phenotype mapping key	Gene/Locus	Gene/Locus MIM number	Cration Date Edit History External Links for Entry: Protein Clinical Resources

TEXT

A number sign (7) is used with this entry because the disorder has been found to be caused by mutation in the gene encoding the caveolin-3 protein (CAV3; 601253).

Digenic inheritance has also been reported; see MOLECULAR GENETICS.

For a discussion of the genetic heterogeneity of long QT syndrome, see LQT1 (192500).

Description

Congenital long QT syndrome is electrocardiographically characterized by a prolonged QT interval and polymorphic ventricular arrhythmias (torsade de pointes). These cardiac arrhythmias may result in recurrent syncope, seizure, or sudden death (Jongbloed et al., 1999).

Molecular Genetics

Vatta et al. (2006) analyzed the CAV3 gene (601253) in 905 unrelated patients with long QT syndrome who had previously been tested for mutations in known LQT genes; in 6 patients, they identified 4 heterozygous missense mutations (601253.0016-601253.0019, respectively) that were not found in more than 1,000 control alleles. Functional studies showed that the mutant caveolin-3 resulted in a 2- to 3-fold increase in the late sodium current of the cardiac sodium channel compared with wildtype.

Cronk et al. (2007) analyzed the CAV3 gene in necropsy tissue from 134 unrelated cases of sudden infant death syndrome (SIDS; 272120) and identified 3 missense mutations in 3 of 50 black infants (601253.0018; 601253.0020; 601253.0021). No mutations were detected in 1 Hispanic or 83 Caucasian infants. Voltage clamp studies demonstrated a gain-of-function phenotype for all 3 CAV3 mutations, with a 5-fold increase in late sodium current compared to controls.



universite

endre le mond

http://omim.org/entry /611818

Several pages of (structured) text describing the Long QT9 form of the disease

Manual annotions only (few data)

Curated data (physicians)

Querying (NCBI Portal)

S NCBI Resource	es 🗹 How To	Θ			Sign in to NCBI
Search NCBI d	atabases				Help
	Lo	ona QT syndrome			Search
Describe formula	-				
Results found in	29 databas	ses for "Long QT syndrome"			
Literature			Genes 2	29 d	atabases queried
Books	353	books and reports	EST	2	expressed sequence tag sequences
MeSH	19	ontology used for PubMed indexing	Gene	33	collected information about gene loci
NLM Catalog	28	books, journals and more in the NLM Collections	GEO DataSets	1	functional genomics studies
PubMed	7,632	scientific & medical abstracts/citations	GEO Profiles	0	gene expression and molecular abundance profiles
PubMed Central	8,065	full-text journal articles	HomoloGene	11	homologous gene sets for selected organisms
Health			PopSet	0	sequence sets from phylogenetic and population studies
ClinVar	1,089	human variations of clinical significance	UniGene	5	clusters of expressed transcripts
dbGaP	138	genotype/phenotype interaction studies	Proteins	F	ntroz Cono
GTR	228	genetic testing registry	4	נשנ	
MedGen	54	medical genetics literature and links	Conserved Domains	0	conserved protein domains
OMIM	59	online mendelian inheritance in man 🛛 🗸 🚺	Protein	232	protein sequences
PubMed Health	119	clinical effectiveness, disease and drug re	Protein Clusters	0	sequence similarity-based protein clusters
			Structure	11	experimentally-determined biomolecular structures
Genomes		\sim	Chemicals		
Assembly	0	genome assembly information	Chemicals		
BioProject	7	biological projects pr			proteins and
		\//hat i	c know	n -	shaut tha
			5 KIIUW	/ (
mprendre le monde,				Inc	Irome?
nstruire l'avenir	THURSDAY		נייצי		

One Entrez Gene entry (Long QT)

KCNH2 potassium channel, voltage gated eag related subfamily H, member 2 [Homo sapiens (human)]

Gene ID: 3757, updated on 3-May-2015

Summary		
Official Symbol Official Full Name Primary source See related Gene type RefSeq status Organism Lineage Also known as Summary Orthologs	KCNH2 provided by <u>HGNC</u> potassium channel, voltage gated eag related subfamily H, member 2 provided by <u>HGNC:HGNC:6251</u> <u>Ensembl:ENSG00000055118; HPRD:01069; MIM:152427; Vega:OTTHUMG0000</u> protein coding REVIEWED <u>Homo sapiens</u> Eukaryota; Metazoa; Chordata; Craniata; Vertebrata; Euteleostomi; Mammalia; Ei ERG1; HERG; LQT2; SQT1; ERG-1; H-ERG; HERG1; Kv11.1 This gene encodes a voltage-activated potassium channel belonging to the eag fa gene can cause long QT syndrome type 2 (LQT2). Transcript variants encoding d <u>mouse</u> <u>all</u>	HGNC 20158341 http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/gene/3757 utheria; Euarchontoglires; Primates; Haplorrhini; Catarrhini; Hominidae; Homo amily. It shares sequence similarity with the Drosophila ether-a-go-go (eag) gene. Mutations in this istinct isoforms have been identified. [provided by RefSeq, Jul 2008]
C Genomic context Genomic regions C IS0791287 THEH1768 ROCI ROCI THEH1768 ROCI THEH17	transcripts, and products hromosome 7 - NC_000007.14 KONH2 LOCI 05375568 N033 AT698 II 51 028267 M Source of the products NO33 AT698 HUJ00284791 M HUJ00284791 M HUJ00284	 A lot of gene-centric information Genomic context, genomic regions
<pre>textures, Release 17 (NCBI Annotation Release 100 c cccossyst) Ensembl release 79 Ensecond Enseco</pre>	supared to Ensembl Release 76)	Gathering of data

Querying (NCBI Portal)

S NCBI Resource	es 🗹 How To				Sign in to NC
Search NCBI d	atabases				Hel
	La	ong QT syndrome			Search
Results found in Literature	29 databas	es for "Long QT syndrome"	Genes	29 d	atabases queried
Books	353	books and reports	EST	2	expressed sequence tag sequences
MeSH	19	ontology used for PubMed indexing	Gene	33	collected information about gene loci
NLM Catalog	28	books, journals and more in the NLM Collections	GEO DataSets	1	functional genomics studies
PubMed	7,632	scientific & medical abstracts/citations	GEO Profiles	0	gene expression and molecular abundance profiles
PubMed Central	8,065	full-text journal articles	HomoloGene	11	homologous gene sets for selected organisms
Health			PopSet	0	sequence sets from phylogenetic and population studies
ClinVar	1,089	human variations of clinical significance	UniGene	5	clusters of expressed transcripts
dbGaP	138	genotype/phenotype interaction studies	Proteins		
GTR	228	genetic testing registry			
MedGen	54	medical genetics literature and links	Conserved Domains	0	conserved protein domains
OMIM	59	online mendelian inheritance in man	Protein	232	protein sequences
PubMed Health	119	clinical effectiveness, disease and drug reports	Protein Clusters	0	sequence similarity-based protein clusters
Genomes			Structure	11	experimentally-determined biomolecular structures
Assembly	0	genome assembly in			bout the
BioProject	7	biological projects p	S KIIOV	VIIC	
	tides		_	-	
	mues			vn	tromo?
truire l'avenir	1111	LUIIG	כ יץ ו	y 1 1 U	
niversite					

One GenBank entry (Long QT)

KVLQT1 - A LONG QT SYNDROME GENE WHICH ENCODES KVLQT1 WHICH COASSEMBLES WITH

GenBank id

GenBank: DI042621.1

FASTA Graphics

http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/nuccore/DI010834.1

<u>Go to:</u> 🖂

LOCUS [DI042621 2821 bp DNA linear PAT 21-FEB-2008						
DEFINITION N	KVLQT1 - A LONG QT SYNDROME GENE WHICH ENCODES KVLQT1 WHICH COASSEMBLES WITH.						
ACCESSION E	DI042621						
VERSION [DI042621.1 GI:168359679						
KEYWORDS K	<pre>(R 1019980704727-A/29.</pre>						
ORGANITSM H	Homo sapiens (human)						
ONGANITON [<u>Tomo sapiens</u> Eukarvota: Metazoa: Chordata: Craniata: Vertebrata: Euteleostomi:						
Ν	Mammalia; Eutheria; Euarchontoglires; Primates; Haplorrhini;						
(Catarrhini; Hominidae; Homo.						
REFERENCE 1	1 (bases 1 to 2821)						
AUTHUKS P	Keating,M.I., Sanguinetti,M.C. and Curran,M.E. AVIOT1 - A LONG OT SYNDROME GENE WHICH ENCODES KVIOT1 WHICH						
(COASSEMBLES WITH						
JOURNAL F	Patent: KR 1019980704727-A 29 20-JUN-1998;						
COMMENT F	PN KR 1019980704727-A/29						
F	20 1998-06-20 DA KEATING MITI SANGUINETTI MICI CURRAN MIE						
F	PR US 8/739.383 (1996-10-29)						
1	TY DNA						
0	OS Homo sapiens						
	CO.						
FEATURES	LOCATION/QUAIITIENS						
3001 CE	/organism="Homo sapiens"						
	/mol type="unassigned DNA"						
	/db_xret= taxon: <u>youb</u>						
ORIGIN							
1 ggd	cttcctcg agcgtcccac cggctggaag ttgtagacgc ggccctggac gtgggtgcgc						
61 gcc	caacaccg ggcggcgcgt gctgtagatg gagacgcgcg ggtctaggct caccggcggc						
121 cag	gggccgcg totacaactt cotogagcgt cocacoggot ggaaatgott ogtttaccac						
241 62	tetareca costagecese anagestete tictagetag egetediet calculage						
301 tto	raagaraa aatarataat cracrtetaa teraeraara atarataaa						
361 cto	ctpppppc ppctpcpctt tpcccppaap cccatttcca tcatcpact catcptpptc						
421 gtg	ggcctcca tggtggtcct ctgcgtgggc tccaaggggc aggtgtttgc cacgtcggcc						
481 ato	caggggca tccgcttcct gcagatcctg aggatgctac acgtcgaccg ccagggaggc						
541 acc	ctggaggc tcctgggctc cgtggtcttc atccaccgcc aggagctgat aaccaccctg						

- GenBank is a deposit of sequences
- → Each sequence must be uploaded to GenBank
- A GenBank entry = nucleotide sequence
 + one reference
 + a few comments
 Raw data

Wrap-up

- Even if scientists use a portal, querying biological databases is not easy...
- High heterogeneity of the sources
 - Very different kinds of contents
 - Free text (OMIM), semi-structured data (GenBank)...
 - From free text to controled vocabulary (free text to Ontologies)
- Diverses levels of data quality
 - From automatically obtained (EntrezGene) to manually annotated (OMIM)
- Different Biological entites
 - OMIM : Disease
 - Entrez Gene : Gene
 - GenBank : Nucleotides



Data Integration for the Life Sciences in 1994

 Robbins, R. J. (1994). "Report of the invitational DOE Workshop on Genome Informatics I: Community Databases." [Rob94a]

• DOE funded large parts of the Human Genome Project

- "Continued HGP progress will depend in part upon the ability of genome databases to answer increasingly complex queries that span multiple community databases. Some examples of such queries are given in this appendix."
- "Note, (...), none of the queries in this appendix can be answered. The current emphasis of GenBank seems to be providing human-readable annotation for sequence information. Restricting such information to humanreadable form is totally inadequate for users who require a different point of view, namely one in which the sequence is an annotation for a computer-searchable set of feature

université

Twelve Queries Unanswerable in 1994

- 1. Return all sequences which map 'close' to marker M on chrom. 19, are put. members of the olfactory receptor family, and have been mapped on a contig
 - Multidatabase: Chromosome maps from GDB, sequence-contig in GenBank, annotation from elsewhere
- 3. Return the map location, where known, of all alu elements having homology greater than "h" with the alu sequence "S".
 - Only needs GenBank and a similarity search

université

- 4. Return all h. gene sequences for which a putative functional homologue has been identified in a non-vertebrate organism
 - Human: GenBank, non-vertebrates: species databases; how to describe function?
- 8. Return the number and a list of the distinct human genes that have been sequenced
 - What is a gene? Semantic heterogeneity and scientific uncertainty
- 11. Return all publications from the last two years about my favorite gene, accession number X####.

Spares Synonyms & homonyms; naming conventions, disambiguation

Take Home Message

- The classical problems are all there already
- Distributed information
- Semantic heterogeneity
 - Scientific uncertainty and evolving concepts
 - Naming conventions on the object level
 - Naming conventions on the concept level
 - Inclusion of non-standard processing





Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

universite





Take Home Message

- The number of sources to be used has increased a lot
- The diversity of the sources has increased a lot
- The complexity of the questions to be answered has increased a lot



Emergence of New Trends

- > The number of sources to be used has increased a lot
- Scalability of integration in number of sources
- > One major goal of the Semantic Web, development of ontologies
- The diversity of the sources has increased a lot
- > Inclusion of quality as a first-class citizen
- Ranking of integrated search results
- The complexity of the questions to be answered has increased a lot
- Integration requires analysis and analysis requires integration
- Scientific workflows



This Tutorial

- Part I Data Integration for the Life Sciences
 - Biological data & biological databases
 - Some Myths, some Truths
 - Presence
- Part II Scientific Workflows



Are BDB Distributed?

> 1,000 different databases

- Plus many data sets that are not stored in a DB
- e.g. Supplementary material
- Content is highly redundant
 - Replica (sequence databases)
 - Large unintentional overlaps (KEGG – Reactome)
 - Large intentional overlaps (species specific data)
 - Some databases mostly copy from other sources
- Content may be curated
- during copying

université



Number of existing (circles) and new databases (triangles) are plotted from 1996 to 2011. New databases are difference between the number of existing databases for each year. DBcat (red) is shown with NAR (blue) counts.

Copyright Geospiza 2011

Each year, the NAR (Nucleic Acid research) journal has a database issue, listing the databases available

Extreme Example: Protein-Protein-Interactions

- There are >500 BDBs related to PPI and pathways
 - See http://www.pathguide.org

 Manually created "source" DBs





Are BDB Heterogeneous?

- Technical heterogeneity: a bit
 - Web services, HTML forms, ...
- Syntactic heterogeneity: not much of a problem any more
 - XML exchange, flatfiles

iniversite

- Many ready-to-use parsers are available
- Semantic heterogeneity: terrible
 - Objects have several names and IDs (and versions and states)
 - Definition of object types are heterogeneous, scientifically uncertain, and change over time
 - Schema element names are heterogeneous
 - Metadata often is not available in sufficient depth

As usual – distribution creates (semantic) heterogeneity



What is a Gene (1)?

universitė



• A stretch of DNA (with holes) on a chromosome that at some stage gets translated into a protein

What is a Gene (2)?



Figure 6-21 part 1 of 2. Molecular Biology of the Cell, 4th Edition.

 A re-assembly of stretches of DNA that are transcribed together plus some further editing on the mRNA level
 Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

What is a Gene (3)?

ndre le mond

universite



Nature Reviews | Molecular Cell Biology

• Like Def.2, plus parts of the sequence downstream that is necessary to regulate transcription of the gene

What is a Gene (4)? [GBR+07]

The same gene?

- Genes may generate different assemblies (differential splicing)
- Gene duplications in a genome
- The "same" gene in another organism
- Mutation of a gene
- Genes with a different start site
- A gene?
 - Pseudo genes (never transcribed, yet highly similar)
 - Non-coding genes
 - miRNA (25 bases!)
- Gene definitions change(d) over centuries, decades, and ... last years



Is Data Quality an Issue in BDB?

- Most important quality aspects: Completeness and error-freeness
- BDB have terrible problems in both aspects
 - Complete collections exist nowhere (maybe except PDB and GenBank)
 - All BDB have a severe level of all kinds of errors
 - Much copy-and-paste problems (predictions become reality)
- Recall: Most BDB are filled from (high-throughput) experiment
 - Experiments that are not perfect
 - Measurements that are highly context-dependent
 - Performing the same experiment again will produce different results
- Recall: Things change a lot over time
 - New techniques
 - New knowledge

UNIVERSITÉ PARIS

université

Are Data Volumes huge?



- All of EMBL now has ~150 TB (zipped), ENSEMBL has ~1TB (MySQL dump), UniProt has ~5GB (zipped)
- Probably 90% of the 1300 DB's in NAR have <1GB</p>
- All secondary databases have "little" data

PARIS

université

Primary data explodes due to Next Generation Sequencing



Sequencing has become commodity



- Sequencing dozens of genomes/exomes feasible for any mid-size research project
- In 5 years: Hundreds of genomes
 - (Inter-)national projects: 100.000+ genomes
- Access to genomes is crucial: Bioinformatics goes medical
 - "Translational Bioinformatics"

université

Data Tsunami



Is Reproducibiliy an Issue?



Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

Is Reproducibiliy an Issue? Studies on reproducibility

- Nekrutenko & Taylor, Nature Genetics (2012)
 - 50 papers published in 2011 using the Burrows-Wheeler Aligner for Mapping Illumina reads.
 - 31/50 (62%) provide no information
 - no version of the tool + no parameters used + no exact genomic reference seq.
 - 7/50 (14%) provide all the necessary details



Is Reproducibiliy an Issue? Studies on reproducibility

- Nekrutenko & Taylor, Nature Genetics (2012)
 - 50 papers published in 2011 using the Burrows-Wheeler Aligner for Mapping Illumina reads.
 - 31/50 (62%) provide no information
 - no version of the tool + no parameters used + no exact genomic reference seq.
 - 7/50 (14%) provide all the necessary details
- Alsheikh-Ali et al, PLoS one (2011)
 - 10 papers in the top-50 IF journals \rightarrow 500 papers (publishers)
 - 149 (30%) were not subject to any data availability policy (0% made their data available)
 - Of the remaining 351 papers
 - 208 papers (59%) did not adhere to the data availability instructions
 - 143 make a statement of *willingness* to share
 - 47 papers (9%) deposited full primary raw data online



Impacts of irreproducibility...



Many landmark findings in preclinical oncology research are not reproducible, in part because of inadequate cell lines and animal models.

Raise standards for preclinical cancer research

C. Glenn Begley and Lee M. Ellis propose how methods, publications and incentives must change if patients are to benefit.

Efforts over the past decade to characterize the genetic alterations in human cancers have led to a better understanding of molecular drivers of this complex set of diseases. Although we in the cancer field hoped that this would lead to more effective drugs, historically; our ability trials in oncology have the highest failure intercompared with other therapeutic areas. It is understandable that barriers to clinical development may be lower than for other fail disease areas, and a larger number ofdrugs en with suboptimal predinical validation will tai

investigators must reassess their approach translating discovery research into gree chnical success and impact. Many factors are responsible for the h failure rate, notwithstanding the inh ently difficult nature of this disease. C tainly, the limitations of preclinical to

47/53 "landmark" publications could not be replicated

Comprendre le monde, construire l'avenir université

[Begley, Ellis Nature, 483, 2012]

Must try harder

Too many sloppy mistakes are creeping into scientific papers. at the data - and at themselves.

Error prone

Biologists must realize the pitfalls massive amounts of data.

If a job is worth doing, it is worth doing twice

Researchers and funding agencies need to put a premium on ensuring that results are reproducible, argues Jonathan F. Russell.

The case for open computer programs

Six red flags for suspect work

C. Glenn Begley explains how to recognize the preclinical papers in which the data won't stand up.

Know when your numbers are significant

Impacts of irreproducibility (cont.)

• Attacks on authors, editors, reviewers, publishers, funders...

Retractions On the Rise A study of the PubMed database found that the number of articles retracted from scientific journals increased substantially between 2000 and 2009. 180





Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

 → Nature checklist
 → Science requirements for data and code availability

Wrap-up

- Integration more necessary than ever in the Life Sciences
- Biological data sources
 - Increasingly numerous, heterogeneous, distributed,...
- → Provenance is needed to understand and interpret data, ranking techniques have to be developed
- Breadth of scientific questions increases
- Reproducibility is a major issue
 Scientific workflows
- Data sources contains errors
- Need standardization
 - \rightarrow Ontologies



This Tutorial

- Part I Data Integration for the Life Sciences
 - Biological data & biological databases
 - Some Myths, some Truths
 - Presence
- Part II Scientific Workflows


Integration -- Classical View



Classical View - Data Warehouse

• Wrappers transform the (+) Fine format of the source data (semantics) integration is sets into the global schema Queries possible of the DWH \rightarrow Syntactic (-) Updating the integration warehouse is the The data warehouse can • major issue contain a collection of (redundant) tables or Data Warehouse curated data (semantic integration) Wrapper Wrapper Wrapper Wrapper Web Web **RDBMS** Files Source Service Apps UNIVERSITÉ PARIS SUD

Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

universite

The Presence

XML + Python + MySQL
 Or better
 XML +

 (Perl | Java | Python) +
 (MySQL | Oracle | PostGreSql)

Big role of open source libraries and frameworks
Ontologies are common practice



The Presence

- Architecture
 - Portals are used a lot but do not perform *tight* integration
 - Federated systems are mostly dead
 - Despite frequent papers stating the opposite
 - Survival in some niches: DAS, some mash-ups (no queries)
 - "Data Warehouses" approaches everywhere
- Semantic integration
 - No schema matching, little query rewriting
 - Performed manually (in custom-written wrappers)
- Several systems up-and-running integrating dozens of sources
 - Freshness in the presence of data cleansing remains a hard problem



Wrap-Up

- Probably >95% of integration projects use materialization
- Successful systems implemented by domain scientists, with little participation of DR
- Very little semantic integration, very little query optimization, very little data fusion, very little schema matching / schema integration
- Full provenance information can/should be recorded



This Tutorial

- Part I Data Integration for the Life Sciences
 - Biological data & biological databases
 - Some Myths, some Truths
 - Presence
- Part II Scientific Workflows



Trend

Analysis is integration and integration is analysis







Classical View - Expanded





universite



Life Science Research Food Chain







Scientific workflow systems (specification)



Encapsulation

Scripts are contained into boxes (steps) Prog. Interface: input, parameters, output Unified representation of steps

Modularization

Steps are independent of each others'

Sector reusability

universite

Scientific workflow systems (execution)

WF execution: data consumed/produced Transparent, optimized, Traceable SWFS scheduling, logging

Transparent Able to run in any environments

Optimized

Able to run on different contexts (cluster, desktop, ...)

Traceable

université

Keep track of the data consumed & produced during the execution





GetFastq ncbi id: SRR628586

GetFastq icbi_id: SRR6285

Scientific workflow systems (wrap-up)

SWFS = "Data analysis pipeline"
Data flow driven
Encapsulation & Modularisation
WF specification: connected tools
steps of the analysis

WF execution: data consumed/produced Transparent, optimized, Traceable data management

Mature systems: Galaxy, NextFlow, SnakeMake...





Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

The Galaxy Project

- Galaxy is an open source, web-based platform for data intensive biomedical research.
- The Galaxy Team is a part of
 - the Center for Comparative Genomics and Bioinformatics at Penn State,
 - the Department of Biology and at Johns Hopkins University.
- The Galaxy Project is supported in part by
 - NSF,
 - NHGRI,
 - The Huck Institutes of the Life Sciences,
 - The Institute for CyberScience at Penn State,
 - and Johns Hopkins University...
- Can be used with
 - the free public server (usegalaxy.org)
 - or other instances (several in France: Institut Curie, Institut Pasteur, Genouest, SouthGreen...)



Galaxy main concepts

https://wiki.galaxyproject.org/Learn

- Pages: documentation within Galaxy. To supplement publications or to present tutorials.
- Workflows: define the steps in an analysis process. Workflows are analyses that are intended to be executed (one ore more times) with different userprovided input Datasets. Steps come from the toolshed.



- Histories are analyses records in Galaxy that show all input, intermediate, and final datasets, as well as every step in the process and the settings used with each job executed.
- Datasets represent individual files or jobs included within a History.
- Data Libraries are collections of Datasets accessible.
 Designed for sharing datasets in between users or
 Subgroups.

université

Workflow execution

Other major workflow systems

université

- Taverna http://www.taverna.org.uk/
- Pioneer, Univ. Manchester 0
- Perfect to combine Web services
- \rightarrow Not used anymore

nextflow <u>https://www.nextflow.io/</u>

- Programmation-oriented (no GUI)
- Increasingly used 0
- Able to represent the specification with arcs labelled with data 0 files names
- Snakemake <u>https://snakemake.readthedocs.io</u>
 - Programmation-oriented (no GUI) 0
 - Need to understand make commands ;)
 - The workflow is described as a set of rules
 - Ability to visualize the execution graph



And many others.... !

- Kepler (<u>https://kepler-project.org/</u>, BioKepler)
- Pegasus (<u>http://pegasus.isi.edu/</u>, Cloud ++)
- Mobyle (<u>http://mobyle.pasteur.fr/</u>)
- OpenAlea (<u>http://openalea.gforge.inria.fr</u>, Plants ++)
- RapidMiner (<u>https://rapidminer.com/</u>)
- WINGS (<u>http://www.wings-workflows.org/</u>, semantics)
- KNIME (<u>https://www.knime.org/</u>)
- Cunieform (works on Hadoop YARN...)



Different systems for different users

Snakemake & Nextflow

- + Excellent systems for programmers (prototyping)
- + Transparency, optimization of execution
- Impossible to be used by end-users
- Re-use, exchange /sharing

Galaxy

- + Excellent system for end-users having admins ③
- \rightarrow 2 kinds of users: programmers(admins) and end-users
- + Provides toolsheds containing tools already encapsulated
- \rightarrow end-users must use the tools available or ask admins
- + easy to share/exchange/reuse workflows within the same toolshed



This Tutorial

Part I – Data Integration for the Life Sciences

- Biological data & biological databases
- Some Myths, some Truths

• Presence

- Part II –Data Integration workflows
 - What are scientific workflow systems
 - Designing a workflow from scratch
 - Repositories of workflows and web services (reuse)
 - workflows and reproducibility
 - Current challenges



Scientific Workflow Repositories









- Upload a scientific workflow
- Search, download & reuse existing scientific workflows
- Most specifically for single workflow system





myExperiment

- myExperiment.org
- Looking for workflows
 - By keywords
 - BioAID... workflow



- Inspecting meta-data (author, favourited by, history...)
- By authors
- By group



. . .





Bio.tools (replaces BioCatalogue)

https://bio.tools/

- Registry of Tools for the Life Sciences
 - find, understand, compare and select resources == **discovery**
 - use and connect them in workflows == (inter)operability
- Leaded by **ELIXIR** (European network of Excellence)
- Each tool must be described using biotoolsSchema
 - a formalized XML schema (XSD) which defines a description model for bioinformatics software (inputs, outputs and operations)
 - EDAM Ontology Terms are used 0
- **EDAM** Ontology

universitė

- bioinformatics types of data including identifiers, data formats, 0 UNIVERSITÉ
 - operations and topics

Description of Tools in Bio.Tools

universite

BLAST API (EBI) Sequence analysis >		Blogged by 5 Referenced in 2 policy sources Tweeted by 23 Mentioned by 1 peer review sites On 1 Facebook pages Referenced in 15 Wikipedia pages Mentioned in 2 Q&A threads
Web API		1633 readers on Mendeley25 readers on CiteULike
http://www.ebi.ac.uk/Tools/webservices/s	ss/ncbi_blast_rest	
http://www.ebi.ac.uk/Tools/webservices/services/se	ss/ncbi_blast_rest Sequence comparison ›	
http://www.ebi.ac.uk/Tools/webservices/se	Sequence comparison >	Documentation

This Tutorial

- Part I Data Integration workflows
 - What are scientific workflow systems
 - Designing a workflow from scratch
 - Repositories of workflows and web services (reuse)
 - Workflows and reproducibility
 - Current challenges
- Part II Ranking Biological data
 - Ranking criteria
 - Introducing ranking into integration solutions
 - Data warehouses
 - Portals

PARIS

universitė



Repro with Workflows: ingredients and levels



Drummond C Replicability is not Regroducibility: Nor is it Good Science, online Peng RD, Reproducible Research in Computational Science Science 2 Dec 2011: 1226-1227

3 ingredients Workflows Specification Chained Tools Workflow Execution Input data and parameters Workflow Environment OS/librairies ...

universite

Repeat

- *Redo*: exact same context
- Same workflow, execution setting, environement
- Same *output*
- \rightarrow Aim = proof for reviewers \odot

Replicate

- Variation allowed in the workflows, execution setting, environement
- Similar *output*
- \rightarrow Aim = robustness

A continuum of possibilities

Reproduce

- Same *scientific result*
- But the means used may be changed
- Different workflows, execution setting, environment
- Different output but in accordance with the result

Reuse

université

- Different scientific result
- Use of tools/... designed in another context



Drummond C Replicability is not Reproducibility: Nor is it Good Science, online Peng RD, Reproducible Research in Computational Science Science 2 Dec 2011: 1226-1227.

Scientific workflow systems (reminder)

SWFS = "Data analysis pipeline"
Data flow driven
Encapsulation of scripts
WF specification: connected
steps of the analysis

WF execution: data consumed/produced Provenance modules data management

SWFS scheduling, logging, May be equipped with GUI

universitė



Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

Capturing the programming environment

Ensuring your workflow has everything it needs to run Libraries, dependencies... → *Transparent execution* Virtual machines capture the programming environment Container solutions



SUC

université

locker

- package an application
 - with all of its dependencies
 - into a standardized unit for software development
- include the application and its dependencies
- but share the kernel with other containers
- They
 - are not tied to any specific infrastructure;
 - run on any computer, on any infrastructure and in any cloud

Lighter solution than classical VM
 BioContainers: a registry of containers!

Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

Reproducibility-friendly features

<mark>6 Systems</mark>: Galaxy, Nextflow, SnakeMake, VisTrails, OpenAlea, Taverna

Specification

Language (XML, Python...) Interoperability (CWL...) Description of steps

- Remote services
- Command line
- Access to source code
 Modularity (nested
 workflows?)

Annotation (tags, ontologies,

Sunversite yexperiment...)

université



Future Generation Computer Systems Volume 75, October 2017, Pages 284-298



Scientific workflows for computational reproducibility in the life sciences: Status, challenges and opportunities

Execution

Language and standard (PROV...,) \rightarrow repeat ... reuse Presentation (interactivity with the results/provenance, notebooks) \rightarrow replicate ... reuse Annotations \rightarrow reuse

Environment

Ability to run workflows within a given environment

Virtual machines

- VMWare, KVM, VirtualBox, Vagran,...
- Lighter solutions (containers)
 - Docker, Rocket, OpenVZ, LXC, Conda

Another kind of systems: Notebooks

IPy IPython I	Dashboard X IPy spectrogram X	5)[
← → ₹2	() 127.0.0.1:8888/a5222740-848b-4ac1-b212-d732c9f8f78b	\$ 3
IP[y]:	Notebook spectrogram Last saved: Mar 07 11:14 PM	
File Ec	it View Insert Cell Kernel Help	
8 %		
Simp An illustrat $X_k = \sum_{n=1}^{N-1}$ using wind We begin I In [1]: And we ca In [2]:	Ie spectral analysis in of the <u>Discrete Fourier Transform</u> $\frac{1}{x_n}e^{-\frac{2\pi i}{N}kn}$ $k = 0,, N-1$ owing, to reveal the frequency content of a sound signal. by loading a datafile using SciPy's audio file support: from scipy.io import wavfile rate, $x = wavfile.read('test_mono.wav')$ he askly view its spectral structure using matplotib's builtin specgram routine: fig. (xx1, x2) = plt.subplotS(1, 2, figsize-(12, 4)) axi.polot(x): ax1.set title'('aaw audio signal')	
	<pre>ax1.plot(x); ax1.set_title('Raw audio signal') ax2.specgram(x); ax2.set_title('Spectrogram');</pre>	
	8000 6000 6000 -200	

université

- Web-based interactive computational environment
- Combination of code execution, text, mathematics, plots and rich media into a single document
- Some systems export workflow execution as executable Jupyter papers...

Scellent mean to explain/present a scientific results obtained

Ten Simple Rules for Reproducible Computational Research (PlosOne)

- > 1: For Every Result, Keep Track of How It Was Produced
- > 2: Avoid Manual Data Manipulation Steps
- 3: Archive the Exact Versions of All External Programs Used
- 4: Version Control All Custom Scripts
- **5**: Record All Intermediate Results, When Possible in Standardized Formats
- 6: For Analyses That Include Randomness, Note Underlying Random Seeds
- > 7: Always Store Raw Data behind Plots
- 8: Generate Hierarchical Analysis Output, Allowing Layers of Increasing Detail to Be Inspected
- 9: Connect Textual Statements to Underlying Results
- ▶ 10: Provide Public Access to Scripts, Runs, and Results
- \rightarrow Several ways to follow them

université

 \rightarrow More or less complex (from manually to fully automatically)

ARIS More or less time-consuming (repeat, reproduce,, reuse)
Wrap up

- Data Integration & Data Analysis
- Scientific workflows plays a major role to analyse bio data sets
- Major systems in place, large variety of solutions: Galaxy (GUI), SnakeMake/NextFlow (scripts)...
- Reproducibility and reuse is improved using such systems
 - Specification: which tools in what order
 - Execution: which data produced/consumed, which parameters
 - Environment: which OS, which librairies, ...
- Notebooks are another very interesting solution (to expose/explain a scientific result)



This Tutorial

- Part I Data Integration for the Life Sciences
 - Biological data & biological databases
 - Some Myths, some Truths
 - Presence

Part II – Data Integration workflows

- What are scientific workflow systems
- Designing a workflow from scratch
- Repositories of workflows and web services (reuse)
- workflows and reproducibility
- Latest results on workflows
- →Or How CS research may have direct impact on LS Improving reuse
 - Managing Provenance
 - Comparing workflows executions



Study on workflow reuse....

- ➣ 36% of elements are re-used
 - These connect workflows quite densely
 - Can be exploited for repository IR
- Re-use rates have a Zipf-like distrib
 - Local : High re-use rates as-is
 - Web-Service : Authors have favorite services, unshared
 - Script & subworkflows : Authors have personal libraries
- ➤ True cross-author re-use is low: 3%
 - Authors have personal preferences & libraries
- Surversite But don't use content from others

université





How to improve reuse?

Help finding similar workflows



université

Make workflow structures less complex!



Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

How to improve reuse?

Help finding similar workflows



université

Make workflow structures less complex!



Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Univ

Scientific Workflow Discovery Improvement



List of 10s or 100s of workflows



Goal

- Group results by similar workflows
- Search by sample workflow
- Provide recommendations
 - Similar workflows
 - Replacements
 - Extensions

•••

Need: Similarity Measures

The Central Question





Example

iniversité

workflows perform microarray analysis integrating various sources (pathway DB, probe mapping, PubMed)



- All three workflows may be used
- entirely (which fits best?) or partly (from probes to pathways)

Similarity search for scientific workflows [VLDB 2014]



With Johannes Starlinger, Bryan Brancotte, Ulf Leser

Framework

- capture all the sim. search techniques
 - Structure-based
 - Graph struct. of the workflow
 - Annotation-based
 - Meta-data (description, tags...)
- Goal of the study
 - compare results obtained by all techniques
 - On various data sets
 - Taverna, Galaxy, VisTrails







Module Comparison





Module Comparison

- Label
- Webservice Uri
- Scripts
- etc







greedymaximum weight







UNIVERSITÉ PARIS SUD ndre le mond

universite

- Set of Modules - Substructures

- Full Structure





UNIVERSITÉ PARIS

universite









Existing Approaches



Existing Approaches

SUD

universite

	Module Comparison	⇒ Module Mapping	Topological Comparison	Normalization
Stoyanovich et al.	single attributes	-	modules	-
Silva et al.	multiple attributes	greedy	modules	V of smaller wf
Bergmann et al.	semantic annot.	max. weight	modules & edges	V + E of query wf
	label edit dist.	max. weight	modules & edges	V + E of query wf
Santos et al.	label matching	-	modules	-
	label matching	-	MCS	V + E of larger wf
Goderis et al.	label matching	-	MCS	-
	label matching	-	MCS	'workflow sizes'
Friesen et al.	type matching	-	modules	-
	type matching	-	MCS	-
	type matching	-	graph kernels	-
Xiang et al.	label matching	-	GED	-
PARIS				



Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

Existing Approaches

nprendre le monde

universite

	Module Comparison	Module Mapping	Topological Comparison	Normalizatio	'n
Stoyanovich et al.	single attributes	_	modules		
Silva et al.	multiple attri			rw	/f
Bergmann et al.	semantic ar			۲y	/ wf
	label edit di	Vhat's be	est	<mark>؛ry</mark>	/ wf
Santos et al.	label match	_			
	label match	At ead	ch step?	, ei	r wf
Goderis et al.	label match				
	label match	As a v	es		
Friesen et al.	type matchi				
	type matching				
	type matching	-	graph kernels	-	
Xiang et al.	label matching	-	GED	-	
PARIS		MCS = Maximum Commor	n Subgraph GED = Graph E	Edit Distance	

Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

Expert Curated Similarity Corpus

FlowAlike — Scientific Workflow Similarity Evaluation

starling@informatik.hu-berlin.de: dashboard | overview | help | logout

Reference workflow:

Are these 10 workflows similar to the reference?



EBI_Kalign 🗹

Multiple sequence alignment using the Kalign tool. This workflow uses the EBI's WSKalign service (see http://www.ebi.ac.uk/Tools /webservices/services/kalign) to access the Kalign tool. The set of sequences to align and the molecule type (protein or nucleic acid) are the input, the other parameters for

the search (see Job_params) are allowed to default.

Note: the WSKalign service used by this workflow is deprecated as of 21st September 2010 and should not be used in any new development. This service is will be retired during 2011. EBI's replacement Kalign services (REST or SOAP) should be used instead.



EBI_NCBI_BLAST_with_prompts 🗗

Run a BLAST analysis using the EBI's WSNCBIBlast service (see http://www.ebi.ac.uk/Tools/webservices /services/ncbiblast). This workflow wraps the EBI_NCBI_BIT I his workflow to provide a basic



BI_INTERPROSCAN B

Note: the WSInterProScan web service used by this workflow is no longer available haveing been replaced by the EMBL-EBI's InterProScan (REST) (http://www.ebi.ac.uk /Tools/webs 0

0

Ø





Expert Curated Similarity Corpus



Expert Curated Similarity Corpus



universite

Results

- Experts agreed on the similarity of workflow pairs
- Annotation-based approaches
 - Provide best results
 - But only a few well-annotated workflows
- Structural approaches
 - Outperform annotation-based
 - Galaxy & VisTrails
 - Graph edit distance is too expensive
 - Module set provides good results
 - Room for solutions in between
 - LayerDecomposition [eScience 2014] with J. Starlinger, U. Leser, S. Davidson, S. Khanna
 - Usable in real environments (myExperiment)
 [Future Generation Computer System 2016]



How to improve reuse?

Help finding similar workflows



universitė



Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Univ

DistillFlow

Distilling workflow structures: Removing redundancy

- Collaboration with Taverna & BioVel
- BioVel (FP7)



- Virtual laboratory: Librairies of workflows for research on biodiversity
- Consortium of 15 partners (9 countries)

→Improving reuse in BioVel
→More generally: improving reuse in Taverna



Use case 1



3 processors duplicated! → Pure redundancy

UNIVERSITÉ PARIS SUD

universite

No redundancy

Use case 2

orendre le mono

universite



Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

Rewriting workflows

- Exploting the implicit iteration feature of Taverna
 - List of items with merge/split instead of single items with duplication
- Assumptions before merging several copies of a processor
 - Only copies with the exact same code
 - Only copies that do not depend on each other
 - Only deterministic processors (same input \rightarrow same output)

\rightarrow 2 anti-patterns and the corresponding rewriting



Anti-pattern (A)

Corresponds to use case 1



 L_i can be one single value or a list of values







This Tutorial

- Part II Data Integration workflows
 - What are scientific workflow systems
 - Designing a workflow from scratch
 - Repositories of workflows and web services (reuse)
 - workflows and reproducibility
 - Latest results on workflows
 - →Or How CS research may have direct impact on LS
 - Improving reuse
 - Managing Provenance
 - Comparing workflows executions



Provenance in scientific workflows

- Provenance is highly important for users to interpret any scientific result
- Workflow systems are now equipped of *Provenance Modules* capturing the exact set of data used and consumed by the execution of each workflow step
- Standards to represent provenance information are now defined (W3C)
- One of the major challenge lies in dealing with the huge amounts of information
 - Example of solution with ZOOM*userviews which use the composition to hide (part of) the data





Workflows are graphs

universite





Edges: Actual dataflow (labelled with data object ids)

universite



Workflow run: Provenance of d447? (tree generated)










Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

Designing composite modules

- Composite modules are typically defined by the workflow designer to
 - Enable **reuse** between workflows
 - **Simplify** the view of the workflow according to what modules the **designer thinks are relevant** in the workflow
- However, users may have different interests,
 i.e. have different relevant modules
- → Several user views of a given workflow should thus be considered, constructed according to each user's interest



Relevant user view



User views may differ





ZOOM*UserViews

• Goals

- Help user **construct relevant user views**
 - Preserving the relationships between relevant modules
- Exploit *user views* to **reduce the provenance information** returned as answer to a query

Contributions

- **Model** for provenance and user views in scientific workflows
- Algorithm (polynomial) for generating relevant user views according to the user's interests (minimal)
- Provenance Reasoning system: Querying provenance through user views



Provenance challenge



- First Provenance Challenge (twiki.ipaw.info)
 - By S. Miles, M. Wilde, I. Foster and L. Moreau, at Washington DC, Sept. 2006
- **Aims:** Understanding the **capabilities** of provenance-related systems (17)
- The challenge process
 - Workflow example (spec + run) provided
 - List of provenance queries to be answered



Workflow Representation



Terminology

SUD

- Nodes are **step-classes** (static)
- Edges capture the **flow of data** between step-classes
- An execution of a workflow generates a partial order of steps (dynamic)
 - Instances of step classes
- PARIS Each step has **input** and **output** data

This Tutorial

- Part II Data Integration workflows
 - What are scientific workflow systems
 - Designing a workflow from scratch
 - Repositories of workflows and web services (reuse)
 - workflows and reproducibility
 - Latest results on workflows
 - →Or How CS research may have direct impact on LS
 - Improving reuse
 - Managing Provenance
 - Comparing workflows executions











The problem of differencing runs is NP-hard on DAGs while polynomial time algorithms can be designed for Series-Parallel (SP) structures \rightarrow Some approaches have considered such restrictions on workflow graph structures

es



université





Is it Series-Parallel?



PARIS



Is it Series-Parallel?

universite



... Another definition of seriesparallel graphs?

Another definition (Non SP-graphs)

G is non-SP iff MaxRed(G) contains G_{forbidden}





Sarah Cohen-Boulakia, Université Paris Sud

Subgraph isomorphism is

polynomial for SP graphs

SPFL-Workflow Model (PDiffView)

- Workflow Specification
 - A series-parallel graph <u>overlaid with well-nested fork</u> <u>and loop subgraphs</u>
 - Four kinds of executions: series, parallel, fork and loop



SPFL-Workflow Model

Valid Runs

• Derived from the specification by applying series, parallel, fork and loop executions recursively



Edit Operations

- Path Insertion, Deletion, Expansion, Contraction
 - **Elementary path**: each internal vertex has exactly one incoming edge and one outgoing edge, and the resulting graph is still valid with respect to the specification.



PDiffView

Problem statement

Given a pair of valid runs R_1 and R_2 of the same specification, and a cost function, compute a **minimum cost edit script** that transforms R_1 to R_2 . The cost of this edit script is also known as the **edit distance** between R_1 and R_2

Polynomial-time algorithm designed in PDiffView for SPFL workflows





Conclusion on workflows

- Workflows plays a crucial role in biological data integration
- Various areas of computer sciences are involved
 - Databases (e.g., to query and store them)
 - Software engineering (e.g., to optimize or rewrite them)
 - Graph algorithmics (e.g., to query and compare them)
 - ... and a lot of other optimization techniques
- Very large spectrum of challenges
 - From very theoretical (e.g., graph theory, equivalence of programs) to very technical and practical (user study, benchmarking on real data sets...)



Conclusions

- Data Integration in the Life Science (DILS) is more important than ever
- Portals perform syntactic integration and are frequently used
- Data warehouses are designed in several places. It remains the most frequently used in the Life Science community
- Faced with the increasing number of
 - data,

université

- sources,
- analytic tools,
- and the increasing complexity of analysis pipelines...

S PARIS. challenges are numerous...

Conclusions (cont.)

 The complexity of the questions to be answered has increased a lot

Integration requires analysis and analysis requires integration

- Scientific workflows
- The diversity of the sources has increased a lot
 - > Inclusion of quality as a first-class citizen
 - Ranking of integrated search results
- > The number of sources to be used has increased a lot
- Scalability of integration in number of sources
- > One major goal of the Semantic Web, development of **ontologies**





- ELIXIR European project (Infrastructure for bioinformatics)
 - Software and data carpentry (coordinator for the French Node)
 - Contact-me 🕲 : cohen@lri.fr



